A myriad of reasons have been presented over the past 150 years for the defeat of the Confederacy in the American Civil War, ranging from a lack of southern industrial might to the failures of southern nationalism, with innumerable reasons listed between. In the mid-nineteenth century, several of the southern states made the perilous decision to separate from the Union, taking a stand against what they perceived as violations of states’ sovereign rights as mandated by the Constitution and the Founding Fathers. This disunion resulted in four tumultuous years of bloody and costly conflict. Whatever the causation of this conflict, one institution above all others contributed to both the start of the war and its costly conclusion. Evangelical Protestantism in the South, brought on by the Second Great Awakening, created airs of religious preeminence and exceptionalism in the southern mind and eventually digressed, after battlefield defeats resulting in astronomical casualties, into the acceptance of a certain religious fatalism. This religious fatalism, shared by rebel soldiers and the southern body politic alike, proved deadly to southern morale and southern will and ultimately led to the downfall of the short-lived Confederacy.

By interpreting the Civil War in religious terms, historians have sought to demonstrate causality while simultaneously underscoring the values that drove a major portion of the South to disavow itself from the America envisioned by the Founders. Indeed, it was this founding vision that caused consternation and angst among southern politicians as their interpretations placed state and individual rights well above any particular national cause. The Right Reverend Thomas Atkinson, referring to the Union’s decision to foray into newly self-established Confederate territory, sermonized in 1861, “We stand today . . . in the midst of circumstances of great doubt and anxiety, with provocations tending to kindle the bitterest and most vehement passions.” Continuing on, the reverend reminded his parishioners, “We [southern Christians] are the servants of Christ, and our master’s eye is upon us in this hour of trial . . . if you endure it to the end you will be saved.” In these words to his congregation on that Sunday in 1861, Atkinson was merely inculcating in his disciples the South’s presupposed favored standing with
God, a status that had been decades in the making in the hearts and minds of the southern body politic. This favored status had its roots fully embedded in the proslavery Christianity and civil religion that evolved in the South during the early decades of the nineteenth century.¹

Both sides, however, throughout the four years of war, maintained that God was on their side and that His divine providence, without doubt, ensured victory. Indeed, the preponderance of the men and women of the Union and Confederacy shared the same religion (Protestantism), the same concept of providence, and the same understanding of God’s wrath and mercy. These men additionally shared the desire to die properly, upholding the tradition of *ars moriendi*—dying the Good Death. For a majority of the combatants, this good death included being right with God, having family or family surrogate close by (e.g. nurses, doctors, close friends), and receiving final absolution in order to receive all benefits of divine grace.²

A vast array of literature pertaining to religion and the American Civil War has become available, particularly in the past two decades, which denotes the aforementioned commonalities, and more than a few noted historians have contended that religious fatalism never held a stranglehold on Confederate soldiers or civilians. In his treatment of the self-perceived invincibility of the Confederate soldier, Jason Phillips has argued that southern soldiers continued to unwaveringly maintain the opinion that God had chosen them for ultimate victory up until (and in some cases, after) the end of hostilities in 1865.³ Additionally, Steven E. Woodworth has posited that “Despite the widespread belief that God was chastening the South [in the years after Gettysburg], most Confederates continued to feel assured that, however severe their punishment might be, God would not, after all, ‘entirely destroy’ the South, His chosen people.”⁴

Conversely, analyzing the effects of religion on the conduct and outcomes of the war was the team of Richard Beringer, Herman Hattaway, Archer Jones, and William Still whose work, *Why the South Lost the Civil War*, identified more than a few instances where a pseudo-religious fatalism settled in on the soldiers of the South and likewise on their civilian counterparts. During the last two years of the war, Confederate soldiers, often bereft of supplies and sustenance, took to plundering the homes and farms of fellow southerners “taking more than the people could give.”⁵ Hardship, coupled with mounting casualty lists and an ever-expanding loss of territory depleted the confidence and motivation of the southern
body politic and the Confederate Army, both of which were sustained by a shared religion. Though Samuel J. Watson shares Drew Gilpin Faust’s belief that “evangelical religion provided psychological reassurance to southern soldiers struggling with the daily threat of personal annihilation,” he further argued that religious conviction among Confederate troops was “malleable enough . . . to permit soldiers to give up the representational role that no longer protected their communities and kin.”

This diminution of confidence and motivation arguably created an air of fatalism in and around rebel camps and brought about the need for large-scale revivals held directly in the various bivouacs of the Confederate Army throughout the war but most notably during the last two years of hostilities. In an effort to hasten conversions and cause the formerly pious to recommit themselves to God’s Army, chaplains throughout the South led the charge to wholly Christianize or re-Christianize all who wore grey, keeping with the widely-held belief (among those in the South) that the Confederate Army was “the most Christian army in the history of the world.” Though the revivals appeared successful, with most Confederates believing that they were “a pledge of God’s intent to save the Confederacy,” the initial perceived necessity for the revivals mandates a closer examination of the role of fatalism, particularly religious fatalism, in the downfall of the Confederacy. In light of recent research findings supporting the concept that societies cannot survive short of a culture of optimism, the effects of religious fatalism on rebel soldiers and civilians deserves another look.

Fatalism can be simply defined as the belief that whatever happened (or happens) had to happen, always involving a sense of necessity. Not to be confused with the Christian term of providence, fatalism implies that one’s own actions cannot change the outcome of a particular event—whatever one does or does not do, the outcome will remain the same. Hugh Rice has argued that fatalism is “resignation in the face of some future event or events which are thought to be inevitable.” Theological necessity (or “God’s will”) should not automatically be considered a term synonymous with religious fatalism. For the purposes of this discussion, religious fatalism will entail the perceived will of God (God’s favor or the lack thereof) on the minds of the southern nation, both in the early, more successful years of the war and during the hell that would culminate in defeat and “a stoic acceptance of an inevitable fate.”
Though Union soldiers and civilians themselves questioned God’s acceptance of their stand against the slave-holding South, particularly in the first two years of war, the Union, as a whole, was able to move past this theological dilemma. This perceived will of God, initially utilized by the South to explain the early victories of the Confederacy over a more powerful and better-supplied foe, would be questioned as more and more southerners began to accept that their alleged favor and their entire way of life was not conducive to God’s plan. More than a few who supported the rebel cause would find themselves asking why God had forsaken them and their seemingly righteous basis for slavery, secession, and war.

This righteous basis found its most profound support in the Protestant schisms that occurred between 1837 and 1845. Americans during the early to mid-nineteenth century often looked to scripture to develop and justify their worldviews, whether anti-slavery, slaveholding, or indifferent. Because the church wielded such vast power in southern culture and southern politics, many viewed the splitting of the major Protestant denominations (Baptist, Methodist, and Presbyterian) as a precursor to something much worse. Representing some 94 percent of all churches in the South, these denominations and their “visible fracturing . . . presaged the rupture of the nation.” This division, wholly propelled by the institution of slavery and its practitioner’s belief that “unless condemned by the Bible, slavery may remain among things indifferent, and be classed with that large number of actions whose moral character depends on the peculiar circumstances of each case,” made denominational choice one of sectional necessity. Moreover, southern clerics “forged an impregnable union between religion, morality, and slavery,” perpetuating slavery in the South.

This national rupture over slavery was wholly representative of the division between those living in the North and those residing in the South. Culturally, what would become the Confederate States of America was arguably the antithesis of the states that would later comprise the Union. Much more agrarian in lifestyle, pseudo-paternalistic in its views towards the peculiar institution of slavery, and bound by an archaic and ill-fitting sense of honor, southern Protestants came to espouse, “Northerners, by their wickedness and infidelity, were forfeiting the nation’s right to be God’s chosen people.” Assuming the self-proclaimed role as God’s chosen people, the Confederacy found ways to utilize scripture to justify slavery, secession, and armed revolt. This justification, further strengthened by clerics who “bestowed divine sanction on the South’s peculiar institution . . . securely establish[ing] the
rectitude of human bondage,” served to shape sectional ideology which eventually evolved into armed revolt.

This armed revolt, beginning with the firing upon Fort Sumter on April 12, 1861, found Confederate President Jefferson Davis early on espousing that a certain piety had overcome the people of the Confederacy and that their cause was indeed “just and holy.” This belief that the Confederate cause was God-inspired and God-supported was quickly inculcated into the minds of the southern citizenry. J. William Jones, former Chaplain of Robert E. Lee’s Army of Northern Virginia, in his *Christ in the Camp*, outlined the early confidence of the men in grey, all holding dearly to the belief that God was a fellow rebel and that He would see them through to sure victory. Additionally, soldiers relied heavily on pious southern civilians for prayer and felt that “southern armies could never be conquered by a godless foe.”

Southern piety indeed remained always in the framework of the war, particularly during the first two years of conflict. This piety found its strength in a multitude of “Fast Days,” whereby President Davis directed the citizens and soldiers of the Confederate nation to fast, attend church, and pray diligently for the Confederacy. Early on, from June 1861 to March 1863, Fast Day sermons were replete with messages of God’s will and God’s grace for the Confederate cause in addition to calls for thoughts and prayers for the soldiers of that cause. Bishop William Meade, on the first Fast Day in June 1861, asked his congregants to “remember those who in our defence [sic] are exposing themselves to all the hardships and dangers of the camp and field.” The Bishop completed his sermon with a reminder that God was on the side of the righteous and the Confederacy was indeed God’s selected instrument to maintain this righteousness. In a later Fast Day sermon, it was posited that the war was “a step out of darkness and into the light; and for that He may bless us and give us more light.” Lacy Drury, in the spring of 1863, made the argument that “we are in God’s good time to be elevated to a dignified rank among the nations of the earth . . . We will win a place among the family of nations.” These sermons, and the hundreds like them held throughout the Confederacy on designated Fast Days, doubtlessly assured the citizens and soldiers not only of the necessity of their struggle but, arguably more importantly, assured the entire body politic of God’s blessing and direction during this tumultuous time.

God’s blessing was constantly desired by most of the fighting men of
both the Confederacy and the Union, particularly when attempting to discern the
ingenuity of their cause or to comprehend the unfathomable death and
dismemberment brought by war. “As war continued inexorably onward and as death
tolls mounted even higher, soldiers on both sides reported how difficult it became to
believe that the slaughter was purposeful and that their sacrifices had meaning.”26 In
view of early victories, it certainly appeared to the soldiers and citizens of the
Confederacy that God was not always on the side that possessed the most beans,
bandages, and bullets. In a letter to his wife in June 1862, in which Robert E. Lee
acknowledged the recent death of his grandson, he additionally displayed his
religiosity by positing “God grant that we may all join [our grandson] around the
throne of our Maker to unite in praise and adoration of the Most High forever.”27
Lee, who had carried his religion on his sleeve since entering the military, early on
declared, “My reliance is in the help of God.”28 Lee took his beliefs of providence
and his beliefs that the seceded South had the blessing of God to his troops in
innumerable ways throughout the conflict—from a quick comment to an enlisted
man, to a formal general order concerning observation of the Sabbath. He ably
utilized the greatest impediment to his conduct of the war (the death of “Stonewall”
Jackson after the battle of Chancellorsville on May 10, 1863) to inspire his men to
emulate Jackson’s “indomitable courage and unshaken confidence in God as our
hope and strength.”29
This confidence in God and on His protection permeated Confederate
Army camps and civilian firesides from 1861 to 1863. As battles were won and lost,
soldiers developed an “increased interest in and awareness of religious matters,”30
which naturally manifested itself in public worship. Though often competing with
the raucousness that all too often finds itself in military camps everywhere and
through every period of history (church services were often held with gambling,
drinking, and cursing going on only a few feet away), groups of those professing an
unyielding belief and faith in God and His predetermined fate were steadily growing
larger. This belief in predestination—that God had long ago predetermined the fate
of the world and hence every individual—was wholly Calvinistic but was in
keeping with the strictures of the conservative Protestant faith that was manifesting
itself in America in the mid-nineteenth century, particularly in the South. Civil War
era Christians talked much about predestination, not to be confused with fatalism,
and many, as they lay dying, accepted their death as God’s Will.31
This blind acceptance of God’s will took a turn for the worse—for the
Confederacy—after the summer of 1863. With a defeat on the fields of Gettysburg and the surrender of an entire Confederate army at Vicksburg, Confederates, by the thousands, made the decision to abandon their fellow soldiers and absent themselves without leave. Less than one month after the foreboding Independence Day of 1863, Jefferson Davis, in an address to the soldiers of the Confederate States in an effort to entice deserters back into the camps, made the argument that “no alternative is left you but victory, or subjugation, slavery, and the utter ruin of yourselves, your families and your country.” This sign of resignation to fate would be just the beginning of a more pronounced fatalism cloaked in religion that would find itself the subject of more than a few Fast Day sermons conducted after August 1, 1863.

Less than three weeks after Davis’s plea to his troops, Stephen Elliot articulated from the pulpit that from the beginning of hostilities, the Confederacy “[has] boldly assumed the position that we were fighting under the shield of the Lord of Hosts” and that

A day of darkness and gloominess has unexpectedly settled down upon us, and without being able to perceive any natural causes sufficient to account for it, we are conscious that ‘our hands hang down and that our knees are feeble,’ and that we are in peril for our cause.

Elliot went on to utilize scripture to posit that “The joy of our hearts is ceased; our dance has turned into mourning.” In an effort to implore the Confederate body politic to worship correctly in order to bring God’s blessings back upon the nation, Benjamin Morgan Palmer tasked the South Carolina Legislature to “lead their constituency in an act of solemn worship to Almighty God, humbly imploring Him to withdraw the chastening hand that has fallen so severely upon our common country.”

Less than four months after Palmer’s exhortation to his audience, Stephen Elliot, again calling for the South to redeem itself through the solemn confession of past sins in order to bring God’s grace back upon the Confederacy, passed on to his audience in a wholly fatalistic appeal:

We have so often seen the gathering of our enemies dispersed by God in answers to our humble prayers—scattered and rolled back in blood and confusion – that we come to-day [sic] boldly to the throne of Grace, firmly believing that our prayers, and supplications, if offered with pure hearts and clean lips, will return to us laden with blessings from the Lord of
Hosts, the God of the Armies of Israel.\textsuperscript{35} Elliot’s words are replete with a suggestion that the Confederacy had fallen from grace and had gotten itself on the wrong side of God. More and more civilians during this period were themselves becoming disposed to accept “God’s will” that the attempt at nation building would be a failing enterprise for the short-lived Confederate States of America.

This acceptance of defeat, though not always obviously prominent, weighed heavily on the soldiers and civilians of the Confederacy during the last two years of conflict. In attempts to hasten the return to God’s favor, religious revivals became all the rage in the Confederate camps. Though occurring before the summer of 1863, these revivals took on a tone of necessity after the disappointments of Gettysburg and Vicksburg. Historians have historically relied upon J. William Jones’s aforementioned \textit{Christ in the Camp} as one means to discern the religiosity of the Confederate soldier while encamped and in battle. Jones’s unique view of the Confederate soldier provided a glimpse into the hell that was war and additionally provided a fragment of the fatalism that haunted the soldier towards the end of the war. This fatalism is often difficult to ascertain as Jones had a tendency to make things seem much better than they actually were. In one letter transcribed by Jones (from John Thomas Jones of the Fifth Alabama to his parents), an acceptance of a pre-determined fate (fatalism) becomes clear when it is articulated that “Whether I shall live or die, I believe all will be ordered for the best.” In that same letter, J. Thomas Jones solidly “put his trust in Christ,”\textsuperscript{36} clearly delineating a pseudo-religious fatalism that appears to have been more prevalent in the Confederacy than previously admitted.

This religious fatalism, this acceptance of a pre-ordained, God-willed fate, was also evident in letters written by Robert E. Lee after July 1863. Lee told his army’s chaplain, J. William Jones, “We may, therefore, with calm satisfaction, trust in God and leave results to Him.”\textsuperscript{37} Lee’s acceptance of his and his country’s fate was additionally evident when he articulated that “We have appealed to the God of battles and He has decided against us . . . Lord, what wilt Thou have me do?”\textsuperscript{38} Lee’s calm acceptance of God’s will towards the end of the war belied the undercurrents of southern society which saw psychological tensions elevating due to ever-increasing casualty lists coupled with changing war aims “combined with religious views to undermine fatally the Confederate war effort.”\textsuperscript{39}

This deadly combination caused many Confederates and southern
civilians, by mid- to late 1863, to begin questioning the war itself—whether the ends justified the means. With the waning of Confederate military power, “civilian will, now undermined by the doubts of religion, could no longer supplement the force of arms.”40 Confederate officials blamed high desertion rates after the summer of 1863 on an assortment of man-induced maladies, but it could as easily be argued that the perceived will of God had changed and acceptance of this fact made it clear that the Confederate soldier could do little about it. Believing that their cause was indeed a lost one, numerous Confederate soldiers and civilians began working on acceptance. Though more than a few were willing to continue taking the fight to the Union Army, religious fatalism had entered the psyche of a large portion of the Confederate Army and its surrounding populations.

In entering the hearts and minds of the populace of the Confederate States, religious fatalism existed in the army camp, in the barroom, on the farm, and in the front parlor. It appeared more readily in the diaries and journals kept by those most affected by the war. Famed diarist, Mary Boykin Chesnut, wrote on January 1, 1864, “One more year of Stonewall would have saved us. Chickamauga is the only battle we have gained since Stonewall died, and no results follow as usual.”41 Chesnut’s acquiescence to the downfall of the Confederacy can be realized in the last five words of her entry. In previous diary entries, Chesnut had repeatedly insisted that God’s favor lay with the Confederacy and that it would be through His favor that the Confederacy would find itself victorious. Laying the blame for the failure of any further meaningful Confederate victories on the death of Stonewall Jackson is further indication of a deeply penetrating fatalism inculcated through the guise of religious pre-eminence and exceptionalism, albeit with a touch of theodicy. Many in the South could not understand why God, who they believed had clearly been on the side of the Confederacy at the beginning of hostilities, had forsaken them, nor why He did not interject Himself on behalf of the Confederate cause.

As has been argued, “God had been steadily withdrawing his favor,”42 and this withholding would cost the Confederacy considerably. For those who viewed the war through a lens of faith (which, according to the numbers of religious converts in Confederate camps, were many), “an ineffable sadness and quiet resignation descended on [them].”43 This sadness and resignation could not help but affect the martial spirit of the fighting man and the supportive spirit of the civilian populace. Without a supportive populace and a culture of optimism, could the Confederacy go on?
Because “optimism [has been] found to be closely associated with both psychological and physical health…and it underpinned achievement in many different domains,” was the lack of optimism from a military and civilian perspective a causative factor in the defeat of the Confederacy? Was this lack of optimism derived directly from the teachings of evangelical Protestantism, which permeated the nation in the mid-nineteenth century? The answers to these questions have not been wholly answered in the preceding pages, but evidence exists which can begin to point one finger back in the direction of religious fatalism as a causative factor in the downfall of the Confederacy. Between the changes in the tone of the sermons delivered on mandatory Fast Days to the changed demeanor and unexplainable decisions of General Robert E. Lee from July 1863 on, religious fatalism undoubtedly existed and even prospered in the short-lived Confederacy. Because the fatalist “is interested in the significance of what happen[ed] . . . fitting it into a narrative that makes sense of [their] lives,” the men and women of the Confederacy, particularly after the summer of 1863, more and more adhered to the belief that God withdrew His favor and punished, with defeat, the South for its sins. This “finally broke the spirit of the [southern] people and the army,” causing the downfall of the Confederate nation.

Notes


6. Ibid., 277-279.


10. Woodworth, 277.


22. Rable, 73.

23. William Meade, _Address on the day of fasting and prayer, appointed by the President of the Confederate States, June 13, 1861. Delivered at Christ Church, Millwood, Va., by Bishop Meade_ (Richmond: Enquirer Book and Job Press, 1861): 14.


25. Drury Lacy, _Address delivered at the General Military Hospital Wilson, N.C. on the day appointed by the President as a Day of Fasting, Humiliation, and Prayer_ (Fayetteville, N.C.: Edward J. Hale & Sons, 1863): 10.


30. Woodworth, 175.

31. Ibid., 175-198.

32. Jefferson Davis, _Address of the President to the Soldiers of the Confederate States_, August 1st, 1863: para. 3.

33. Stephen Elliot, _A Sermon Preached in Christ Church, Savannah, on Friday, August 21st, 1863 being the Day of Humiliation, Fasting and Prayer appointed by the President of the Confederate States_ (Savannah: Power Press of George N. Nichols, 1863): 5-6.

34. Benjamin Morgan Palmer, _A Discourse before the General Assembly of South Carolina on December 10, 1863, Appointed by the Legislature as a Day of Fasting, Humiliation and Prayer_ (Columbia: Charles P. Pelham State Printer, 1864): 3.

35. Stephen Elliot, “Gideon’s Water-Lappers,” _A Sermon Preached in Christ Church, Savannah on Friday, the 8th day of April, 1864. The Day set apart by the Congress of the Confederate States as a Day of Humiliation, Fasting and Prayer_ (Macon, GA: Burke, Boykin & Company, 1864): 5-6.


37. Jones, 1875, 144.


40. Ibid., 293.

42. Rable, 362.
43. Ibid., 364.
44. Oliver Bennett, 116.
Bibliography


_____.


_____.

“Gideon’s Water-Lappers,” A Sermon Preached in Christ Church, Savannah on Friday, the 8th day of April, 1864. The Day set apart by the Congress of the Confederate States as a Day of Humiliation, Fasting and Prayer. Macon, GA: Burke, Boykin & Company, 1864.


Fuller, Richard & Francis Wayland. Domestic Slavery Considered as a Scriptural Institution: In a Correspondence between The Rev. Richard Fuller of Beaufort, S.C., and The Rev. Francis Wayland, of Providence, R.I. Boston: Lewis Colby, 1845.


Lacy, Drury. Address delivered at the General Military Hospital Wilson, N.C. on the day appointed by the President as a Day of Fasting, Humiliation, and Prayer. Fayetteville, NC: Edward J. Hale & Sons, 1863.


Meade, William. Address on the day of fasting and prayer, appointed by the President of the Confederate States, June 13, 1861. Delivered at Christ Church, Millwood, Va., Richmond: Enquirer Book and Job Press, 1861.

Mitchell, Reid. “Christian Soldiers? Perfecting the Confederacy.” In Religion and the American Civil War, edited by Randall M. Miller, Harry S. Stout, and


Robert (Bob) Wheeler is nearing the end of his Master of Arts in Military History with a concentration in Civil War Studies from American Military University and holds a MA in Public Policy from Liberty University. He resides in the California desert with his wife Lindsay and four children, Nessa, Robby, Riley, and Rex. Originally from Virginia, Bob grew up with a strong interest in all things Civil War and, after spending nearly two decades as a United States Marine and travelling to over forty countries on six continents, he is finally pursuing his passions. On full disability, Bob and his wife homeschool their children and spend their time travelling and learning. In the past six years, they have travelled
to over thirty states to include visits to the Smithsonian, Manassas, Gettysburg, Appomattox, the Black Hills, and Lake Superior. In addition to spending time with his family, Bob enjoys reading and researching for a planned monograph concerning religious fatalism and the downfall of the Confederacy.